

2023 ERIE COUNTY CoC RATING CRITERIA FOR RENEWAL/EXPANSION PROJECTS

Under the 2023 HUD Continuum of Care process, the Erie County Continuum of Care is required to rate and rank all renewal projects. The HUD 2023 Rating and Ranking tool that was released from HUD was modified to meet local priorities and performance outcomes and is being utilized for the 2023 rating and ranking process. In order to rate all renewals in a fair and impartial manner, the rating tool consists of an evaluation system based on performance measures, data quality, application accuracy, fund utilization, Housing First/low barrier implementation, and grant utilization. The overall score will equal 180 points maximum when a project receives a perfect score for all performance benchmarks and will be weighted to a score of 100. The criteria for the benchmarks were developed from the System Performance Measures and the projects last submitted Annual Performance Report. The benchmarks for other criteria were obtained from the individual 2023 project applications, HUD invoices, and monitoring reports submitted from the Erie County Department of Human Services and HUD. The benchmarks that were established for the evaluation include the following:

- Length of Stay –On average, participants are placed in housing within 30 days after project start to RRH/PSH.
- 90% or More of Participants in Permanent Supportive Housing will remain in or move to Permanent Housing
- 50% or More of Participants in Rapid-Rehousing will move to Permanent Housing***
- 10% or Less of Participants return to homelessness within 12 months of exit
- 8% or More of Participants (Stayers) Will Increase Their Earned Income
- 10% or More of Participants (Stayers) Will Increase Their Non-Employment Income
- 8% or More of Participants (Leavers) will Increase Their Earned Income
- 10% or More of Participants (Leavers) will Increase Their Non-Employment Income
- PSH - 90% or More of Dedicated Beds for Chronic Homelessness were utilized
- RRH – 20% or More of Beds were utilized for Chronically Homeless
- 95% or More of all entries came from CE referrals
- Project will Abide by Housing First/Low Barrier Model
- Program has Policies to Create More Equitable Outcomes
- Project Incorporates Feedback from Persons with Lived Experience
- Overall Completeness, Quality and Accuracy of Application
- Data Quality is 90% or More
- Fund Utilization – Utilized 90% or More of funds from Previous Year

*New Expansion grants will be scored based on Performance Measures of Renewal Grant it is expanding.

**Projects will receive full points for criteria met and will receive a graduated reduction in points based on percentages below criteria (e.g. if scoring criteria was 90% or More, and project only met 45%, they would only receive 50% (half) of the points).

***Criteria (percentage) was lowered for Rapid Rehousing (RRH) providers for Permanent Housing exits because during the pandemic. RRH provider were encouraged to work with many who were eligible for Permanent Supportive Housing (PSH) but there were no PSH openings to get chronically homeless, many who were at high risk of COVID complications, out of congregate shelters and off the streets.

2023 ERIE COUNTY CoC RATING CRITERIA FOR NEW PROJECTS

Under the 2023 HUD Continuum of Care process, the Erie County Continuum of Care is required to rate and rank all renewal projects. The HUD CoC Program Rating and Ranking tool that was released from HUD, was modified to meet local priorities and performance outcomes, and is being utilized for the 2023 rating and ranking process. In order to rate all renewals in a fair and impartial manner, the rating tool consists of an evaluation system based on performance measures, data quality, application accuracy, fund utilization, Housing First/low barrier implementation, and grant utilization. The overall score will equal 180 points maximum when a project receives a perfect score for all performance benchmarks and will be weighted to a score of 100. The criteria for the benchmarks were developed from the System Performance Measures and the projects last submitted Annual Performance Report. The benchmarks for other criteria were obtained from the individual 2023 project applications, HUD invoices and monitoring reports from the Erie County Department of Human Services. The benchmarks that were established for the evaluation include the following:

- Experience of Applicant in Working with the Proposed Population and in Providing Housing
- Experience with utilizing a Housing First/Low Barrier Approach
- Experience in Effectively Utilizing Federal Funds including HUD Grants and Other Public Funding
- Applicant Demonstrates Understanding of Needs of Client Served, Housing Needs, Supportive Service Needs, Mainstream Benefits Understanding and Ability to Establish Performance Measures.
- Plan to Assist Participants to Rapidly Secure and Maintain Permanent Housing that is Safe, Affordable, Accessible, and Acceptable.
- Plan to Assist Participants to Increase Employment and/or Income
- Leverages Housing Resources not Funded by CoC or ESG Programs
- Leverages Health Resources
- Plan for Rapid Implementation of Program
- Audit – Most Recent Found No Exceptions to Standards, Identified as Low-Risk, No Findings
- Documented Match Amount
- Budgeted Costs are Reasonable, Allocable and Allowable
- Coordinated Entry Participation
- Incorporating Feedback from Persons with Lived Experience
- Policies and Plan for Equitable Outcomes
- Completeness, Quality and Accuracy of Application

HUD Threshold Requirements

In order for a project to be accepted, the project must meet all HUD threshold requirements below:

- Applicant has Active SAM registration with current information and maintains an active SAM registration annually.
- Applicant has Valid UEI (Unique Entity Identifier) Number.
- CoC Program Eligibility – Project applicants and potential subrecipients meet the eligibility requirements of the CoC Program as described in the Act and the Rule and provide evidence of eligibility required in the application (e.g., nonprofit documentation).
- Financial and Management Capacity: Project applicants and subrecipients demonstrate the financial and management capacity and experience to carry out the project as detailed in the project application and the capacity to administer federal funds.
- Certifications - Project applicants submit the required certifications specified in the NOFO.
- Population Served - The population to be served meets program eligibility requirements as described in the Act, the Rule, and the NOFO.
- 8. Applicant has no Outstanding Delinquent Federal Debts – It is HUD policy, consistent with the purposes and intent of 31 U.S.C. 3720B and 28 U.S.C. 3201(e), that applicants with outstanding delinquent federal debt will not be eligible to receive an award of funds unless.
 - a) A negotiated repayment schedule is established and the repayment schedule is not delinquent, or
 - b) Other arrangements satisfactory to HUD are made before the award of funds by HUD
- Applicant has no Debarments and/or Suspensions – In accordance with 2 CFR 2424, no award of federal funds may be made to debarred or suspended applicants, or those proposed to be debarred or suspended from doing business with the Federal government.
- Pre-selection Review of Performance - If your organization has delinquent federal debt or is excluded from doing business with the Federal government, the organization may be ineligible for an award. In addition, before making a Federal award, HUD reviews information available through any OMB-designated repositories of government-wide eligibility qualification or financial integrity information, such as Federal Awardee Performance and Integrity Information System (FAPIIS), and the “Do Not Pay” website. HUD reserves the right to
 - a) Deny funding, or with a renewal or continuing award, consider suspension or termination of an award immediately for cause;
 - b) Require the removal of any key individual from association with management or implementation of the award; and
 - c) Make provisions or revisions regarding the method of payment or financial reporting requirements
- Sufficiency of Financial Management System - HUD will not award or disburse funds to applicants that do not have a financial management system that meets Federal standards as described at 2 CFR 200.302. HUD may arrange for a survey of financial management systems for applicants selected for award who have not previously received Federal financial assistance, where HUD Program officials have reason to question whether a financial management system meets Federal standards, or for applicants considered high risk based on past performance or financial management findings
- False Statements - A false statement in an application is grounds for denial or termination of an award and may result in criminal, civil, and/or administrative sanctions, including fines, penalties, and imprisonment. Recipient or applicant confirms all statements are truthful.
- Mandatory Disclosure Requirement - Recipients or applicants disclose in writing to the awarding program office at HUD, all violations of Federal criminal law involving fraud, bribery, or gratuity violations potentially affecting the Federal award within ten days after learning of the violation. Recipients that have received a Federal award including the term and condition outlined in

Appendix XII to 2 CFR part 200—Award Term and Condition for Recipient Integrity and Performance Matters are required to report certain civil, criminal, or administrative proceedings to SAM. Failure to make required disclosures can result in any of the remedies described in § 200.338 Remedies for noncompliance, including suspension or debarment. (See also 2 CFR part 180, 31 U.S.C. 3321, and S.C. 2313.)

- 14. Prohibition Against Lobbying Activities - Applicants are subject to the provisions of Section 319 of Public Law 101-121, 31 U.S.C. 1352, (the Byrd Amendment), and 24 CFR part 87, which prohibit recipients of federal awards from using appropriated funds for lobbying the executive or legislative branches of the Federal government in connection with a Federal award. All applicants submit with their application the signed Certification Regarding Lobbying included in the Application download from Grants.gov. In addition, applicants disclose, using Standard Form LLL (SFLLL), “Disclosure of Lobbying Activities,” any funds, other than federally appropriated funds, that will be or have been used to influence federal employees, members of Congress, or congressional staff regarding specific awards. Federally-recognized Indian tribes and tribally designated housing entities (TDHEs) established by federally-recognized Indian tribes as a result of the exercise of the tribe’s sovereign power are excluded from coverage of the Byrd Amendment, but state-recognized Indian tribes and TDHEs established only under state law shall comply with this requirement. Applicants submit the SFLLL if they have used or intend to use non-federal funds for lobbying activities.
- Equal Participation of Faith-Based Organizations in HUD Programs and Activities – Projects ensure that all projects meet the requirements under 24 CFR 5.109. On April 4, 2016, HUD amended 24 CFR 5.109 consistent with E.O. 13559, entitled Fundamental Principles and Policymaking Criteria for Partnerships with Faith-Based and Other Neighborhood Organizations (75 Fed. Reg. 71319 (Nov. 22, 2010)). (See 81 FR 19355). These regulations apply to all HUD programs and activities, including all of HUD’s Native American Programs, except as may be otherwise provided in the respective program regulations, or unless inconsistent with the respective program authorizing statute.
- Resolution of Civil Rights Matters - Outstanding civil rights matters be resolved before the application submission deadline. Project applicants, who after review are confirmed to have civil rights matters unresolved at the application submission deadline, will be deemed ineligible. Their applications will receive no further review, will not be rated and ranked, and will not receive funding.

CoC Threshold Requirements

In order for a project to be accepted, the project must meet all CoC threshold requirements below:

- Coordinated Entry Participation
- Housing First and/or Low Barrier Implementation
- Documented, secured minimum match
- Project has reasonable costs per permanent housing exit, as defined locally
- Project is financially feasible
- Applicant is active CoC participant*
- Application is complete and data are consistent
- Acceptable organizational audit/financial review

* Exceptions could be granted with Ranking and Scoring Committee approval vote

RENEWAL/EXPANSION PROJECT RATING TOOL

Project Name: _____
 Organization Name: _____
 Project Type: PSH (General)
 Project Identifier: 3

Print Blank Template

Print Report Card

Renewal/Expansion Projects
 Rating Complete

Met all threshold requirements

100%

RATING FACTOR	PERFORMANCE GOAL	PERFORMANCE	POINTS AWARDED	MAX POINT VALUE
PERFORMANCE MEASURES				
Length of Stay				
Permanent Supportive-Housing	On average, participants are placed in housing 30 days after project entry	<input type="text"/> days	<input type="text"/> out of	20
Exits to Permanent Housing				
NOTE: Fresh start did not house anyone new in FY21				
Permanent Supportive-Housing	90% remain in or move to PH	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	25
Returns to Homelessness				
Within 12 months of exit to permanent housing	≤ 10% of participants return to homelessness within 12 months of exit to PH	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	15
New or Increased Income and Earned Income				
Earned income for project stayers	8%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Non-employment income for project stayers	10%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Earned income for project leavers	15%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Non-employment income for project leavers	25%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Performance Measures Subtotal			0	out of 70
SERVE HIGH NEED POPULATIONS				
Permanent Supportive-Housing	≥ 90% of participants are chronically homeless	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	10
NOTE: RRH does not require dedicated CH beds				
Serve High Need Populations Subtotal			0	out of 10
PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS				
Coordinated Entry Participation	≥ 95% of entries to project from CE referrals	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Housing First and/or Low Barrier Implementation	Commits to applying Housing First model	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Project Effectiveness Subtotal			0	out of 20
EQUITY FACTORS				
Agency Leadership, Governance, and Policies				
Process for receiving & incorporating feedback	Process includes persons with lived experience	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Program Participant Outcomes				
Program changes for equitable outcomes	Plan to create more equitable program outcomes	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Equity Factors Subtotal			0	out of 20
OTHER AND LOCAL CRITERIA				
RRH (General) - Data Quality is at or above 90%	0	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
RRH (General) - Recipient spent down 90% of their	0	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	20
Completeness, Quality and Accuracy of Renewal	0	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	30
Other and Local Criteria Subtotal			0	out of 60
TOTAL SCORE			0	out of 180
Weighted Rating Score				out of 100

PROJECT FINANCIAL INFORMATION

CoC funding requested	<i>NOTE: Edit on the LIST OF PROJECTS TO BE REVIEWED tab</i>	\$ <input type="text"/>
Amount of other public funding (federal, state, county, city)		<input type="text"/>
Amount of private funding		<input type="text"/>
TOTAL PROJECT COST		\$ <input type="text"/>
CoC Amount Awarded Last Operating Year	<i>NOTE: Edit on the LIST OF PROJECTS TO BE REVIEWED tab</i>	\$ <input type="text"/>
CoC Amount Expended Last Operating Year	<i>NOTE: Edit on the LIST OF PROJECTS TO BE REVIEWED tab</i>	\$ <input type="text"/>
Percent of CoC funding expended last operating year		<input type="text"/>

RENEWAL/EXPANSION PROJECT RATING TOOL

Project Name: _____
 Organization Name: _____
 Project Type: RRH (General)
 Project Identifier: 4

Print Blank Template

Print Report Card

Renewal/Expansion Projects
 Rating Complete

Met all threshold requirements



RATING FACTOR	PERFORMANCE GOAL	PERFORMANCE	POINTS AWARDED	MAX POINT VALUE
PERFORMANCE MEASURES				
Length of Stay				
Rapid Re-Housing	On average, participants are placed in housing 30 days after project entry	<input type="text"/> days	<input type="text"/> out of	20
Exits to Permanent Housing				
NOTE: Fresh start did not house anyone new in FY21				
Rapid Re-Housing	50% move to PH	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	25
Returns to Homelessness				
Within 12 months of exit to permanent housing	≤ 10% of participants return to homelessness within 12 months of exit to PH	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	15
New or Increased Income and Earned Income				
Earned income for project stayers	8%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Non-employment income for project stayers	10%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Earned income for project leavers	15%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Non-employment income for project leavers	25%+ of participants with new or increased income	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	2.5
Performance Measures Subtotal			0	out of 70
SERVE HIGH NEED POPULATIONS				
Rapid Re-Housing	≥ 20% of participants are chronically homeless	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	10
NOTE: RRH does not require dedicated CH beds				
Serve High Need Populations Subtotal			0	out of 10
PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS				
Coordinated Entry Participation	≥ 95% of entries to project from CE referrals	<input type="text"/> %	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Housing First and/or Low Barrier Implementation	Commits to applying Housing First model	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Project Effectiveness Subtotal			0	out of 20
EQUITY FACTORS				
Agency Leadership, Governance, and Policies				
Process for receiving & incorporating feedback	Process includes persons with lived experience	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Program Participant Outcomes				
Program changes for equitable outcomes	Plan to create more equitable program outcomes	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
Equity Factors Subtotal			0	out of 20
OTHER AND LOCAL CRITERIA				
RRH (General) - Data Quality is at or above 90%	0	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	10
RRH (General) - Recipient spent down 90% of their	0	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	20
Completeness, Quality and Accuracy of Renewal	0	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/> out of	30
Other and Local Criteria Subtotal			0	out of 60
TOTAL SCORE			0	out of 180
Weighted Rating Score				out of 100

PROJECT FINANCIAL INFORMATION		
CoC funding requested	<i>NOTE: Edit on the LIST OF PROJECTS TO BE REVIEWED tab</i>	\$ <input type="text"/>
Amount of other public funding (federal, state, county, city)		<input type="text"/>
Amount of private funding		<input type="text"/>
TOTAL PROJECT COST		\$ <input type="text"/>
CoC Amount Awarded Last Operating Year	<i>NOTE: Edit on the LIST OF PROJECTS TO BE REVIEWED tab</i>	\$ <input type="text"/>
CoC Amount Expended Last Operating Year	<i>NOTE: Edit on the LIST OF PROJECTS TO BE REVIEWED tab</i>	\$ <input type="text"/>
Percent of CoC funding expended last operating year		<input type="text"/>

NEW PROJECTS RATING TOOL

Project Name: _____ Print Blank Template _____ Print Report Card _____
 Organization Name: _____
 Project Type: _____ New Projects Rating Complete
 Project Identifier: _____ Met all threshold requirements 0%

RATING FACTOR	POINTS AWARDED	MAX POINT VALUE
EXPERIENCE		
A. Describe the experience of the applicant and sub-recipients (if any) in working with the proposed population and in providing housing similar to that proposed in the application.	<input type="text"/>	out of 15
B. Describe experience with utilizing a Housing First approach. Include 1) eligibility criteria; 2) process for accepting new clients; 3) process and criteria for exiting clients. Must demonstrate there are no preconditions to entry, allowing entry regardless of current or past substance abuse, income, criminal records (with exceptions of restrictions imposed by federal, state, or local law or ordinance), marital status, familial status, actual or perceived sexual orientation, gender identity. Must demonstrate the project has a process to address situations that may jeopardize housing or project assistance to ensure that project participation is terminated in only the most severe cases.	<input type="text"/>	out of 15
C. Describe experience in effectively utilizing federal funds including HUD grants and other public funding, including satisfactory drawdowns and performance for existing grants as evidenced by timely reimbursement of subrecipients (if applicable), regular drawdowns, timely resolution of monitoring findings, and timely submission of required reporting on existing grants.	<input type="text"/>	out of 20
Experience Subtotal	0	50
DESIGN OF HOUSING & SUPPORTIVE SERVICES		
A. Extent to which the applicant 1. Demonstrate understanding of the needs of the clients to be served. 2. Demonstrate type, scale, and location of the housing fit the needs of the clients to be served. 3. Demonstrate type and scale of the all supportive services, regardless of funding source, meet the needs of the clients to be served. 4. Demonstrate how clients will be assisted in obtaining and coordinating the provision of mainstream benefits. 5. Establish performance measures for housing and income that are objective, measurable, trackable, and meet or exceed any established HUD, HEARTH or CoC benchmarks.	<input type="text"/>	out of 15
B. Describe the plan to assist clients to rapidly secure and maintain permanent housing that is safe, affordable, accessible, and acceptable to their needs.	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
C. Describe how clients will be assisted to increase employment and/or income and to maximize their ability to live independently.	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
D. Project leverages housing resources with housing units not funded through the CoC or ESG programs.	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
E. Project leverages health resources, including a partnership commitment with a healthcare organization.	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
Design of Housing & Supportive Services Subtotal	0	35
TIMELINESS		
A. Describe plan for rapid implementation of the program documenting how the project will be ready to begin housing the first program participant. Provide a detailed schedule of proposed activities for 60 days, 120 days, and 180 days after grant award.	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
Timeliness Subtotal	0	5
FINANCIAL		
B. Audit 1. Most recent audit found no exceptions to standard practices 2. Most recent audit identified agency as 'low risk' 3. Most recent audit indicates no findings	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
C. Documented match amount	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
D. Budgeted costs are reasonable, allocable, and allowable	<input type="text"/>	out of 15
Financial Subtotal	0	35
PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS		
Coordinated Entry Participation- 95% of entries to project from CE referrals	<input type="text"/>	out of 5
Project Effectiveness Subtotal	0	5
EQUITY FACTORS		
Agency Leadership, Governance, and Policies Recipient has relational process for receiving and incorporating feedback from persons with lived experience of homelessness	<input type="text"/>	out of 10
Program Participant Outcomes Recipient has identified programmatic changes needed to make program participant outcomes more equitable and developed a plan to make those changes	<input type="text"/>	out of 10
Equity Factors Subtotal	0	20
OTHER AND LOCAL CRITERIA		
Completeness, Quality and Accuracy of New Project Application	<input type="text"/>	out of 30
Other and Local Criteria Subtotal	0	30
TOTAL SCORE	0	180
Weighted Rating Score	0	100
PROJECT FINANCIAL INFORMATION		
CoC funding requested	NOTE: Edit on the LIST OF PROJECTS TO BE REVIEWED tab	\$ <input type="text"/>
Amount of other public funding (federal, state, county, city)		\$ <input type="text"/>
Amount of private funding		\$ <input type="text"/>
TOTAL PROJECT COST		\$ <input type="text"/>